ความสัมพันธ์เชิงเหตุผลระหว่างพฤติกรรมการเป็นสมาชิกที่ดีขององค์กรและเจตนาการลาออกของพนักงาน: การศึกษาเปรียบเทียบบริษัทโคมไฟโคPIDAIระหว่างประเทศจีนและไทย

CAUSALITY BETWEEN ORGANIZATIONAL CITIZENSHIP BEHAVIOR AND EMPLOYEE TURNOVER INTENTION: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THAI AND CHINESE LIGHTING COMPANIES

เว่ยตง ชู*
Weidong Qu*
เกียรติอนันต์ ล้วนแก้ว**
Kiatanantha Lounkaew**

* นักศึกษาปริญญาโท สาขาวิชาการบริหารธุรกิจอาเซียน บัณฑิตวิทยาลัย มหาวิทยาลัยธุรกิจบัณฑิตย์
* Student, Master of Business Administration in ASEAN Program, Graduate School, Dhurakij Pundit University
* Email: qwda35335@hotmail.com
** อาจารย์ประจ้า และปริญญาเอก มหาวิทยาลัยธรรมศาสตร์
** Lecturer and PhD., Thammasart University
บทคัดย่อ

การศึกษาครั้งนี้มีวัตถุประสงค์หลักคือเพื่อศึกษาความสัมพันธ์เชิงเหตุผลระหว่างพฤติกรรมการเป็นสมาชิกที่ดีขององค์กร (Organizational Citizenship Behavior: OCB) กับเจตนาการลาออกของพนักงาน (Employee Turnover Intention) เป็นการศึกษาเปรียบเทียบบริษัทโคมไฟระหว่างประเทศจีนและไทย ผลการศึกษาจาก Linear Regression Model พบว่า ตัวแปรที่สามารถทานาย (Predict) เจตนาการลาออกของพนักงานกลุ่มสัญชาติไทยคือพฤติกรรมการเป็นสมาชิกที่ดีขององค์กร การรับรู้งานทางเลือก (Perceived Job Alternatives) และรุ่นอายุ (Generation) ส่วนบริษัทไทย กลุ่มสัญชาติจีน มีแต่ตัวแปรการรับรู้งานทางเลือกตัวเดียวสามารถทานายการลาออกของพนักงานได้ ผลการศึกษาจาก Probit Model พบว่า การรับรู้งานทางเลือกสามารถทานายเจตนาการค้นหางานใหม่ (Intention to Search) และเจตนาการลาออก (Intention to Leave) การมีน้าใจนักกีฬา (Sportsmanship) อายุงาน (Job Tenure) ตำแหน่งงาน (Position) สามารถทานายได้แต่เจตนาการลาออก

คำสำคัญ: พฤติกรรมการเป็นสมาชิกที่ดีขององค์กร เจตนาการลาออกของพนักงาน

Abstract

This paper investigates the influence of Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) on employee turnover intention of participants from a Thai and a Chinese lighting company. The result of linear regression exercises show that OCB, perceived job alternatives and generation are the most powerful predictor for the variance of employee turnover intention for Thai sample. As to Chinese sample, only the causality between perceived job alternatives and intention to leave is available while all other variables cannot predict the variance of employee turnover intentions. In addition, probit regression providing findings that both intention to search and intention to leave can be explained by perceived job alternatives, while tenure, position and sportsmanship only take accounts of intention to leave.

Keywords: Organizational Citizenship Behavior, Employee Turnover Intention
Introduction

From the standpoint of this study, human resources are an important asset for a company. To retain the best employees in the organization and motivate them to contribute more to the organization, business organizations should pay attention to employees’ turnover intention, which is directly or indirectly related to the stable performance of a business organization. Some actions which may affect employees’ turnover intention can be taken by a business organization, such as treating employees fairly and setting employee engagement mechanisms in order to make the organization a better place to work. However, the biggest difference between Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) and employee engagement is that the former is usually made freely and voluntarily by employees while the latter usually entails a business organization’s time and money. OCB has been used to examine employee retention and empirical research has demonstrated that OCB does have a relationship with turnover intention. Therefore, it’s significant to further determine the causality between OCB and employee turnover intentions. Although OCB research has been conducted in many contexts and industries, it is new for ASEAN+6. This study was conducted at two lighting companies from two different countries. This is different from previous research. The participants in previous research are usually from the same country, but in different industries. This study selected two lighting companies which are in the same industry where one is a Thai company and the other is a Chinese company.

Statement of the problem

The first research problem is that previous research gave a mean score for OCB with regard to its effect on employee turnover intention (Chen, 2005; Koys, 2001; Krishnan and Singh, 2010; Mossholder, Settoon and Hanagan, 2005). It is therefore difficult to determine which form of OCB has a greater effect on employee turnover intention. This study selects three special forms of OCB examining the relationship between OCB and employee turnover intention to assess which form predicts employee turnover intention and has the greatest effect. The second research problem is that previous research has largely overlooked other dimensions of turnover intention, such as perceived job alternatives and intention to search. This study added perceived job alternatives to independent variable and intention to search to the turnover intention dimension.

Objectives of the study

1. to examine the extent to which the organizational citizenship behaviors contribute the variance of turnover intentions
2. to examine the extent to which the perceived job alternatives contribute the variance of turnover intentions
3. to examine the extent to which the generation contributes the variance of turnover intentions
4. to examine the extent to which the tenure contributes the variance of turnover intentions
5. to examine the extent to which the nationality contributes the variance of turnover intentions
Conceptual Framework

Organizational citizenship behavior:
1. Helping behavior
2. Sportsmanship
3. Civic virtue
4. Perceived job alternatives
5. Generation 6. Tenure 7. Nationality

Turnover Intention
1. Intention to search
2. Intention to leave

Figure 1 Conceptual framework

Literature Review

Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) seems to be incompatible with turnover intention since the nature of OCB reflects a willingness of the employee to stay with the employer. OCB can be performed by many ways, such as, providing help to co-workers when they have work-related problems or taking steps to prevent creating work-related problems for others; tolerating trivial matters without complaint; and acting as a good citizen in the organization, like being a good citizen of a country. According to social exchange theory, these behaviors, which are made voluntarily and freely, are performed based on treatment by the organization. Performing OCB indicates that employees intend to stay with the organization and reciprocate the employer’s care, support and the organization’s fair treatment. The more employees exhibit OCB, the less likely they are to leave the employer. When OCB is widespread, valued and sustained in an organization, the best employees tend to be retained (Paillé, 2012).

Turnover intention reflects a mental decision intervening between an individual’s attitudes regarding a job and the stay or leave decision. Perceived job alternatives, intention to search and intention to leave are typical dimensions of turnover intention. Perceived job alternatives refer to external opportunities for a job which an employee can find, or the ease of finding a new job outside the current organization. When employees find that it is easy to find a better job outside the current organization, they will actively search for new job opportunities and may intend to leave. While when employees find that it is difficult to find an acceptable new job, which is at least as good as the one they have now, they will reduce the search activity and still stay with the current organization.

When employees perceive that their value on labour market increases, they might actively search new job possibility to quit from current organization, especially for employees who are young people. Therefore, we also assume that generation and tenure are also related to employee turnover intention. To author’s knowledge, nationality’s prediction on employee turnover intention is under-researched.
Relevant Research

Paillé (2012) found a negative relationship between altruism and the intention to leave, but altruism was found that had a positive relationship with the intention to search. Paillé and Grima (2011)’s research examined the relationship between helping behavior and turnover intention. The result indicated that helping behavior explained the intention to leave the current job better than the intention to leave the employer. In Paillé (2012), helping was found to be positively related to the intention to leave. Sportsmanship was found to be best predictor of the intention to leave the organization. This strong power was demonstrated in the findings of Paillé and Grima (2011) and Paillé (2012). In addition, sportsmanship has also been found to have a negative relationship with the intention to search (Paillé, 2012). Paillé and Grima (2011) found that civic virtue had a negative relationship with the intention to leave the organization. Paillé (2012) also examined the relationship between sportsmanship and turnover intention. The result partly supported the findings of Paillé and Grima (2011) who found that civic virtue was negatively related to the intention to leave. In addition, civic virtue was also found to be negatively related to the intention to search (Paillé, 2012).

Previous research found that perceived job alternatives affect the intention to leave through the intention to search (Paillé, Raineri and Valeau, 2015). From the findings of Paillé (2012), perceived job alternatives and the intention to search are positively related, and the intention to search is positively related to the intention to leave. Tenure failed to explain the variance of both the intention to leave the organization and the intention to leave the current job in the study of Paillé and Grima (2011).

Hypothesis

Hypothesis 1-6: three scales of organizational citizenship behaviors which are helping behaviors, sportsmanship and civic virtue can predict intention to search and leave, respectively.

Hypothesis 7-8: perceived job alternatives can predict intention to search and leave, respectively.

Hypothesis 9-10: generation can predict intention to search and leave, respectively.

Hypothesis 11-12: tenure can predict intention to search and leave, respectively.

Hypothesis 13-14: nationality can predict intention to search and leave, respectively.

Methodology

This study collects data from the whole target population. They are white-collar workers who currently work in L&E Manufacturing Co., Ltd and Ningbo Three Proof Lighting Technology Co., Ltd. There is no sampling in this study because of the use of census. The amount of Thai participant is 76 and that of Chinese participant is 41. Total amount of participant is 117. The data were collected in April of 2016.

The author assumed that frequency of performing organizational citizenship behavior of each single employee perhaps affect employee’s turnover intention. Accordingly, five levels of frequency of performing OCB are set as “never”, “seldom”, “sometimes”, “often”, and “always”. Then OCB is measured as helping behavior, civic virtue and sportsmanship. Under helping behavior, there are nine items. Regarding to civic virtue, there are four items and sportsmanship also contains four items. Agreement level is used to measure employee’s turnover intention. The extent of
agreement divided into “not agree at all”, “not agree”; “indifferent”, “agree” and “totally agree”. Turnover intention in this study is measured by perceived job alternatives, intention to search and intention to leave.

The first model employed is a linear regression model using intention to search and intention to leave as dependent variables. Independent variables include measures for organization citizenship behavior as well as demographic and work-related characteristics of participants. In addition, probit model is used to analyze the data in this study. Probit model is a regression model used for the case that dependent variables are choice of only two values. To perform the probit regression in this study, the author converted the continuous value from 1 to 5 to 0 and 1 by classifying value 1-3 as 0 which means intend to retain and 4-5 as 1 which means intend to quit.

Results

Table 1 provides a summary of related variables. By and large, it can be seen that the results are consistent with the literature and hypotheses of this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Thai (n = 76)</th>
<th>Chinese (n = 41)</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RH</td>
<td>β</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>HB</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>-.327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>HB</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>-.176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>CV</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>-.275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4</td>
<td>CV</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>-.287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5</td>
<td>SH</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>-.269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H6</td>
<td>SH</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>-.215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H7</td>
<td>PJA</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>.348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H8</td>
<td>PJA</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>.453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H9</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>-.315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H10</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>-.250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H11</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>-.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H12</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>-.135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H13</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>.318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H14</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>.126</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: RH, research hypotheses; HB, helping behavior; CV, civic virtue; SH, sportsmanship; PJA, perceived job alternatives; G, generation; T, tenure; N, nationality; S, intention to search; L, intention to leave; n.s., non-significant; s, supported.

In addition to table 1 which provides results of linear regression for testing research hypotheses, table 2 provides results obtained from probit regression analysis for the causality between selected independent variables and intention to leave and intention to search. Details of the estimates are given in Table 2 below.
Considering table 2, position, tenure, sportsmanship and perceived job alternatives are significant variables which were found that had significant relationships with the intention to leave. While there was no significant relationship between ages, education, helping behavior, civic virtue, gender, nationality and the intention to leave, respectively. Although gender was significant in model 1 (see table 2), it was non-significant in the model 2 and model 3 (see table 2). It suggests that the effect of gender was replaced by another factor. Unlike position and tenure, this had significant relationships with the intention to leave in all models. A perceived job alternative is the best predictor of the intention to leave. Regarding the extent to which organizational citizenship behaviors contributed to the variance in the intention to leave the organization, some patterns (sportsmanship) seem like they can be generalized while other patterns (helping behavior and civic virtue) were affected by the participants and employment in that industry. To date, sportsmanship was the best predictor of the intention to leave among the dimensions of OCB, while helping behavior and civic virtue contributed to the variance of the intention to leave is controversial. Unfortunately, this issue cannot be resolved by this study.
For intention to search in table 2, the probit model indicated that nationality and perceived job alternatives can predict the variance of employees’ intention to search while age, education, position, tenure, helping behavior, civic virtue, sportsmanship and gender did not have relationships with the intention to search. Perceived job alternatives also had a significant positive relationship with the intention to search in both model 2 and model 3 (see table 2) and was the best predictor of the intention to search. This finding was consistent with that of Paillé (2012) who found the same relationship by using path analysis ($\beta = 0.146$, $t$-value = 2.464, $p = 0.014$). Even though the relationship between nationality and the intention to search was not significant when perceived job alternatives and OCB were added in the probit model, to the author’s knowledge, there was no available previous empirical research providing the same findings about this relationship. This finding may be first found in this study.

For intention to search in table 2, nationality and perceived job alternatives were found to have impact on the variance. Regarding the intention to leave, it seemed that it can be affected by other variables. From the findings of this study, there were five variables which have been found to have relationships with the intention to leave. They were gender, perceived job alternatives, position, tenure and sportsmanship. The relationship between nationality and the intention to search and gender and the intention to leave were only evident in the first probit model but not in the other two models (see table 2). Therefore, only perceived job alternatives can predict the intention to search and the variables that can predict the intention to leave were perceived job alternatives, position, tenure and sportsmanship. A perceived job alternative was found to be able to predict both the intention to search and the intention to leave. With regard to the impact of OCB on turnover intention, OCB was found to only affect the intention to leave, and sportsmanship was the only variable which can predict the intention to leave.

**Conclusion**

The first purpose of this research is to examine the causality between OCB and employee turnover intention. The linear regression results for the Thai sample show that helping behavior only explains some of the variance of the intention to search and this is consistent with findings of Paillé (2012) and Paillé, Raineri and Valeau (2015). There is no causality between helping behavior and the intention to leave and this is consistent with findings of Paillé, Raineri and Valeau (2015). However, it’s not consistent with finding of Paillé and Grima (2011) who found that helping behavior is negatively related to intention to leave the organization and not consistent with finding of Paillé (2012) who found that helping behavior is positively related to intention to leave the organization. The negative causality between helping behavior and the intention to search suggests that the more employees helping each other, the less they intend to search for a new job. Neither the causality between helping behavior and the intention to search nor the causality between helping behavior and the intention to leave are available for the Chinese sample. This finding is consistent with that of Paillé, Raineri and Valeau (2015) who found that helping behavior was not related to both intention to leave the organization and intention to search. Civic virtue has negative causality with both the intention to search and the intention to leave, and this causality is only available for the Thai sample. This finding is consistent with that of Paillé (2012) who found that civic virtue was negatively related to both intention to leave the organization and intention to search. The negative
The causality between civic virtue and turnover intention suggest that the more employees perform civic virtue, the less turnover intention they have. Regarding the Chinese sample, civic virtue is neither related to the intention to search nor to the intention to leave and no available previous findings indicate that civic virtue is not related to both intention to search and intention to leave the organization. Sportsmanship has negative causality with the intention to search and does not have causality with the intention to leave for the Thai sample. This finding only partly consistent with that of Paillé (2012) who found that sportsmanship was negatively related to intention to search because there was no evidence to show that sportsmanship was not related to intention to leave the organization in previous findings. The negative causality between sportsmanship and the intention to search suggests that employees who have higher levels of sportsmanship are less likely to search for a new job than those who have lower levels of sportsmanship. For the Chinese sample, sportsmanship is not related to either the intention to search or the intention to leave. This finding is also not consistent with previous findings since sportsmanship is always related with both intention to search and intention to leave the organization in previous findings. Overall, OCB can predict employee turnover intention, but this causality is only significant in the Thai sample. Civic virtue has causality with both the intention to search and the intention to leave. Helping behavior and sportsmanship only have causality with the intention to search. For the Chinese sample, there is no causality between OCB and employee turnover intention.

The second research objective of this study is to examine the causality between perceived job alternatives and employee turnover intention. Perceived job alternatives have positive causality with both the intention to search and the intention to leave in the Thai sample. This finding only partly consistent with that of Paillé (2012) who found that perceived job alternatives is positively related to intention to search. In addition, direct relationship between perceived job alternatives and intention to leave the organization is under-researched in previous researches. The positive causality between perceived job alternatives and turnover intention suggests that employees who perceive that it is easy to find a new job which at least as good as the one they have now or a better one, are more likely to search for new job opportunities outside the organization and finally opt to quit than those who find that it is difficult for them to find an acceptable job outside the current organization. In the Chinese sample, perceived job alternatives only takes into account the variance of the intention to leave and no causality was found between perceived job alternatives and the intention to search. This finding is not consistent with that of Paillé (2012) who found that perceived job alternatives is positively related to intention to search. In addition, direct relationship between perceived job alternatives and intention to leave the organization is under-researched in previous researches.

The third research objective is to examine the causality between generation and employee turnover intention. The results show that generation has causality with both the intention to search and the intention to leave in the Thai sample. The negative causality between generation and employee turnover intention indicates that the older generation has higher turnover intentions than the younger generation. Regarding the Chinese sample, generation is not found to have any causality with either the intention to search or the intention to leave. Since the relationship between generation and employee turnover intention is under-researched in previous researches, there is no enough and available evidence can be referred for this point.
The fourth research objective is to examine the causality between tenure and employee turnover intention. Tenure is not found to have any causality with either the intention to search or the intention to leave for both the Thai and the Chinese samples. This finding is partly consistent with that of Paillé and Grima (2011) who found that tenure is not related to intention to leave the organization.

The last research objective is to examine the causality between nationality and employees turnover intention. However, nationality must be tested in a combined data which includes both the Thai and the Chinese samples. The linear regression analysis result indicates that nationality has causality with the intention to search but does not have causality with the intention to leave. The causality between nationality and the intention to search shows that nationality can predict the intention to search and it might be that Thai and Chinese employees have different behaviors in job search activities. As well as generation, relationship between nationality and employee turnover intention is under-research in previous researches, no enough and available evidence can support or disagree with this finding. In addition, this study separated dimensions of OCB and added perceived job alternatives as independent variable and intention to search to turnover intention in order to solve previous research problems which mentioned in statement of the problem.

**Practical Implications**

On the basis of the negative causality between position and the intention to leave, it can be recommended that suitable promotion can enhance employee morale and retention. However, how to make decision about the promotion of employees? Generally speaking, business organizations usually promote experienced employees who have worked for the organization for a long time; however, the findings of this study provide a new perspective from the discovery of the positive causality between tenure and the intention to leave and the negative causality between sportsmanship and the intention to leave. In other words, the research results indicate that organizations should promote employees who have high levels of sportsmanship, rather than those who have rich experience when business organization needs to appoint new managers or top management. Since employees, who have high level of sportsmanship, are more likely to choose to stay with the organization instead of choosing to leave the organization when they get more and more job tenures in the organization than employees who have rich experiences. This is never been mentioned or found in previous findings.

From the findings of both linear regression and probit model, it’s been found that OCB does predict employee turnover intention and recommendations can be made as follow. For example, a business organization can purposefully select new employees who exhibit high levels of OCB when recruiting by using various approaches; managers or human resource department can use OCB as an indicator of the employee’s state of mind about leaving since lacking of willingness in performing OCB can be viewed as first step of withdraw process. Indeed, if managers find that employees are not willing to perform OCB or have low levels of OCB, it might indicate that employees have work-related problems and are not satisfied with their current work conditions. Useful and timely approaches made by managers or related departments can minimize employee’s dissatisfaction and then effectively reduce their turnover intention. In short, observing employee’s state of mind about employee retention by using OCB can alert managers to take action before
decision about leaving has been made by employees which might affect the stable performance of business organization.

The Limitations of Research

There are three rating methods to measure organizational citizenship behavior: self-rating, supervisor-rating and co-worker-rating. This study selected self-rating as the method to measure the frequency of performing organizational citizenship behavior by employees. Self-rating might cause common method variance bias which results from social desirability bias. In other words, the risk of using self-rating for the estimation of organizational citizenship behavior is the overestimation of employees’ own OCB level. Future research could try to use supervisor-rating or co-worker-rating to offset or minimize this overestimation. However, it is difficult to say that supervisor-rating or coworker-rating is better than self-rating. Actually, self-rating, supervisor-rating, and coworker-rating have their own advantages and disadvantages. It is perhaps best left to the researcher’s own judgment.

Two different companies were selected in an attempt to offset and minimize the potential differences of employees responding to OCB and turnover intentions caused by different national and organization culture and other factors affecting the two companies. However, generalizing the practical implications provided by this study is problematic because the samples came from a single industry, which is the lighting industry in Thailand and China. Future research could expand the research field to more industries, especially production workers in industries with high levels of turnover, to examine the relationships between OCB and employee turnover intention.
Bibliography


